

La LATIN LITURGY ASSOCIATION

Office of the Chairman
Prof. Dr. Anthony Lo Bello
Box 29, Dept. of Mathematics
Allegheny College
Meadville, PA 16335
(814) 724-5362

NEWSLETTER NO. 28
MARCH, 1988

Vice Chairman
Dr. Robert J. Edgeworth
P.O. Box 80426
Baton Rouge, LA 70898

Secretary-Treasurer
Attorney John M. Spangler
P.O. Box 575
Versailles, KY 40383

From The Chairman

The Chairman announces with pleasure the appointment of Attorney John M. Spangler, P.O. Box 575, Versailles, KY 40383 to the office of Secretary-Treasurer of the Association. His duties will be to maintain the membership rolls and collect the dues. The former Secretary-Treasurer, Professor Edgeworth, was promoted to the rank of Vice Chairman; he is in charge of organizing and directing the local chapters and of preparing for the next national convention, which we shall hold in 1989. The Chairman takes this opportunity to thank Attorney William J. Leininger of New York City, who has been supplying him with the mailing labels for the newsletter.

Dies Irae

Mr. Clarence Zaar of San Francisco has brought to the attention of the Chairman the fact that the text of the *Dies Irae* that appears in the new *Liturgia Horarum* (IV, p. 489) and the Solesmes *Liber Hymnarius* (p. 126) has *Peccatricem qui solvisti* instead of *Qui Mariam absolvisti*. Now there is not the least reason for supposing the woman in the incident described in *Luke VII 36-50* (no other Gospel has the story) to have been Mary Magdalene, but in the Middle Ages, it was so supposed. Have the monks of Solesmes and the Holy See changed the text to do battle against this illegitimate identification, or does the Chairman give them too much credit, and have they made the change because they fear that the clergy may be too dull to know the difference between the Blessed Virgin and Mary Magdalene? If any one knows the true story behind *Peccatricem qui solvisti*, please write to the Chairman.

Ordo Missae Cum Populo

It has come to the attention of the Chairman that many churches, when they institute a regularly scheduled Latin Mass, go to the unnecessary expense of printing a Latin-English booklet for their congregation. *There is already such a booklet*, an excellent one, the *Ordo Missae Cum Populo*, published by the Leaflet Missal Company, 419 West Minnehaha

Avenue, St. Paul, Minnesota 55103. It contains the Latin and English texts of the Mass (all four Canons) and musical notation for the congregational parts in Latin. It is paperbound and 35 pages long. The imprimatur is by the late Bishop Lawrence P. Graves, who was a member of our Association. For 100 or more copies, the price is \$1 each plus 5% shipping; a single copy costs \$1.50 plus .50 shipping. The only mistake in the booklet is that the Papal keys at the bottom of page 30 are upside down.

Oratio Equitum

The Chairman publishes below the Latin prayer of the Knights of Malta, some of whose members belong to the Association.

Domine Jesu, qui me Militiae Equitum Sancti Ioannis Hierosolymitani participem fieri dignatus es, Te humiliter deprecor ut, Beata Maria Virgine a Filermo, Sancto Ioanne Baptista cunctisque Sanctis intercedentibus, ad sacra Ordinis nostri instituta servanda benigne me adiuves;

Religionem catholicam, apostolicam, romanam firmiter colam ac adversus impietatem strenue defendam.

Caritatem erga proximum, praesertim erga pauperes atque infirmos, diligenter exerceam.

Concede mihi virtutes, quibus indigeo, ut, ad Evangelii normam, haec pia vota ad maiorem Dei gloriam, totius mundi pacem, nostrique Ordinis profectum, mei immemor animoque penitus christiano, valeam implere. Amen.

Cassettes Of St. Mark's Gospel In Latin

The *Societas Latina*, Universitat - FR 6.3, D-6600 Saarbrücken 11, West Germany, has produced three cassettes on which Dr. Maximilian Mangold of Saarbrücken University reads the Gospel of St. Mark and then selected passages from the other three Gospels. This expert pays strict attention to the quantity of vowels. The price for the three tapes is 36 German marks; those who want a booklet

containing the text must pay an additional 9.60 marks. Dr. Mangold reads from the Stuttgart edition of the Vulgata, which one may buy from the American Bible Society, 1865 Broadway, New York City, NY 10023. Ask for their "Scholarly Scripture Resources" catalogue. This famous critical edition has the *imprimatur* of the Archbishop of Freiburg-im-Breisgau.

The *Societas Latina* also offers, for 12 marks, a cassette recording of several Gregorian Chants sung according to the ancient ("restored") Latin pronunciation, rather than the Italian pronunciation heard on the Solesmes recordings. The booklet of texts costs an additional 5 marks.

Payment may be made by personal check at current exchange rates.

Chairperson

The Chairman implores his correspondents not to refer to him as *chairperson*. He will refuse any mail addressed to him under that absurd title. One must oppose emphatically all attempts to corrupt the English language. *Principiis obsta!*

Errata

Two zip codes were reported incorrectly in the last newsletter. Mr. Corvaia's (the Philadelphia local chairman) is 19106, and the zip for Still River, Massachusetts is 01467.

Eminentissimus Gagnon, Cardinalis Visitator

The Holy See has nominated Edouard, Cardinal Gagnon to be Apostolic Visitor to the Fraternity of Pius X; his charge is to investigate and propose a settlement to the legal disputes over the Society's status in canon law. He is to report directly to the Pope. Of all the cardinals, he is said to be the most favorable to Archbishop Marcel Lefebvre. The announcement, of an agreement was made at the Vatican on October 17 and had previously been made by Archbishop Lefebvre at Ecône on October 2. The name of Cardinal Gagnon was made public at the Synod by

Cardinal Ratzinger in a speech on October 29. Cardinal Gagnon's representative, Msgr. Camillo Perl, attended the High Mass at the Church of St. Nicholas de Chardonnet, Paris, on Sunday, November 22; the church is a stronghold of the Society, which has 205 priests worldwide and 280 seminarians. Archbishop Lefebvre has ordained 315 priests from Ecône, which Cardinal Gagnon visited in mid-November together with Msgr. Perl, who is a functionary of the Congregation for Divine Worship. Both celebrated only the "Old" Mass during their visits to the Society's facilities.

Archbishop Lefebvre was appointed Apostolic Delegate to French West Africa in 1947 by Pius XII and was consecrated Bishop in that year by Achilles, Cardinal Lienart, Bishop of Lille. In 1955, he became Archbishop of Dakar, where he was installed by Eugene, Cardinal Tisserant, Dean of the College of Cardinals. Later he became Archbishop-Bishop of Tulle (France) and Superior General of the Holy Ghost Fathers. On November 20, he wrote to the Director of his American seminary:

I think that as his visit continues, Cardinal Gagnon is more and more convinced that we are right to be doing what we are doing. However, if his visit is useful, it is not the answer.

We shall have to find a form of institution to protect us from the Roman Curia and the diocesan chanceries. In Rome we shall need a secretariat or commission, composed of members agreeing with what we think and do, to help the Society set itself up with three bishops chosen from within the Society, to form like an "Armed Services' Vicariat", with all the powers necessary to continue our work, independently of all other bishops. A way must be found for all Traditional movements and initiatives to normalize their juridical situation so that they can continue to ask for the help of our own bishops.

The whole thing is to know whether Rome, that is to say the Pope, will have the courage, despite the howling set up by the bishops and the Roman Curia, to grant us such a degree of independence. There are several Cardinals who will support Cardinal Gagnon. But it will not be easy. Already the episcopates are getting together to prevent a solution.

In any case, if they do not give me the authorization to consecrate bishops, I shall do it without authorization. This is the most practical and pressing point. Let us continue to pray, especially to Our Lady of Fatima.

It is to be hoped that the Holy See does not

botch this business and require everyone who wants the old Mass to go to Archbishop Lefebvre. There are people who want Latin liturgy who will not go to the Society of St. Pius X. The old Mass should be available for everyone without silly permissions and petitions.

Video Tape Recording Of The Latin Mass

A broadcast quality presentation of the Latin Mass (old rite) is available from Latin Mass Video, 9903 Santa Monica Blvd., #245, Beverly Hills, CA 90212 for \$32.95. The 140 minute VHS tape includes the Solemn High Mass and Low Mass of the 15th Sunday after Pentecost as well as the Benediction of the Most Holy, celebrated with the permission of Basil, Cardinal Hume at St. Mary of the Angels, London, on August 31, 1986. A 36 page booklet is included that contains the entire Latin and English texts.

This is an exquisite production, and the Chairman recommends it enthusiastically to the members. The Solemn High Mass and Benediction are celebrated by the wonderful Msgr. McDonald (see pages 14-15 of the last newsletter); alas, the celebrant of the Low Mass stumbled over his Latin.

The tape brought back to the Chairman memories of his youth, when the Mass was celebrated so beautifully; the comparison with the present state of affairs moved him to tears. He has heard many arguments why the vernacular liturgy is superior to the old rite, but his eyes and ears reject them all.

The Press

1. Peter Occhiogrosso's book *Once a Catholic: Prominent Catholics and Ex-Catholics Reveal the Influence of the Church on Their Lives* (Houghton Mifflin) was the subject of a front page article in the November 1, 1987 issue of the *National Catholic Register*. We read:

Ironically, although Occhiogrosso and some of his subjects left the Church because of conflicts about the Vietnam War and sexuality, they object to vernacular Masses and other post-Vatican II liturgical changes.

"I think that for a lot of people, the Latin Mass, accompanied by the music, incense, icons and art, inspired people in the sense of being involved in something special and something out of the ordinary," he said.

"It's like Robert Stone said: 'The Church I left no longer exists.' In an effort to make the Mass more 'relevant' — that horrible catchword from the '60s, the Church made it irrelevant in

many Catholics' spiritual lives."

"It's funny. On the one hand, the Church wants to be a font of verities and says it will never change its position on contraception, and yet it will change a time-honored liturgy and make it sound like a Burger King commercial."

2. The September, 1987 issue of *Challenge* magazine (Volume 13, No. 10) reports, on pages 3 and 4, that the Latin Liturgy has been restored at the Bavarian abbey of Saints George and Martin at Weltenburg, near Kelheim:

During the 60's "updating", the abbey's community almost vaporized. There was a welter of experimentation, gross instability, and loss of faith. The number of monks was reduced to about four. So one of the monks, then in his thirties, became abbot almost by default.

He restored the divine office in common and Latin as the language of worship.

The result: a long array of monks on both sides of the monastic choir, most in their twenties, with perhaps one or two in their thirties. Novices now flock to the abbey and new foundations will be made once sufficient youngsters are priested and have completed their studies.

3. "Latin Language resurrected by synod" is the title of an article on page 14 of the October 23, 1987 issue of *The Chicago Catholic*. The author, Mr. Agostino Bono, reports that 25% of the synodal delegates made their interventions in Latin, which was used more than any other language. English, French, and Spanish came next in that order; German and Italian were allowed, but Portuguese and all other languages were strictly prohibited. However, when the bishops broke up for discussions in small groups, only 7 of the 230 fathers chose the Latin Language group in which to deliver their utterances.
4. Professor Fr. Caelestis Eichenseer, editor of the journal *Vox Latina*, has published a Latin account by the Chairman of the proceedings of our National Convention in Volume 23, Number 89. Any member who would like a xerox copy of this short article should send a self-addressed stamped envelope to the Chairman.
5. The November 1, 1987 issue of *Our Sunday Visitor* carried the article "Dinner with the Pope: an unforgettable experience" by Albina Aspell, who, along with eight other English speaking auditors at the recent Synod, was invited to dinner with the

Pontiff last October. Aspell, editor of *The Catholic Post*, the newspaper of the Diocese of Peoria, described the various courses (potato soup and an omelet for the Pope, broth with corn meal and beef steak for the guests) and the conversation, and we are distressed to read:

We speak of language, of the beauty of Latin, which the Pope admits is dead, but in which we all pray at the synod, and in which the opening Mass at St. Peter's was celebrated.

Considering the circumstances, one must take this *cum grano salis*. The Pope's authoritative utterances on Latin are not to be discovered in second-hand reports of his table-talk. Our San Francisco member Mr. Ken Solak sent a letter of protest which was published in the November 29th issue of the *Visitor*; as a result of this letter, many inquiries have been made to the Chairman, and several new members have been won.

6. The American Dom Columba Stewart of St. John's Abbey, Collegeville, Minnesota, in the "Viewpoint" column in the 24 October issue of *The Tablet*, reproved the Roman See for trying to reach a settlement with Archbishop Marcel Lefebvre, who, Dom Columba wrote, had rejected the Vatican Council, gone into schism, and waged war on the Church. His immoderate attack was censured in two letters to the editor that appeared the following week.
7. The December 6, 1987 issue of *The National Catholic Register* printed an interview with Cardinal Decourtray, Archbishop of Lyons. He was asked what he thought about the followers of Archbishop Marcel Lefebvre. He replied:

It's a disparate movement. Some members just reject certain changes made in the liturgy of their childhood. Others protest the council's Declaration on Religious Liberty. Still others reject the whole council and even the Pope's authority. I hope that Cardinal Edouard Gagnon's mission [as apostolic visitor] will clarify the differences within the movement. Will he succeed in a reconciliation? For that, we must pray and fast, in silence.

In the same issue, Paul Hallett devoted his column to "The Church's Ancient Tongue," Latin. He censures the ignorance of those who claim that the ancient language cannot express modern thought; he condemns the error of them that spurn tradition. He says that slowly eliminating Latin was the tactic of those who wanted to introduce revolutionary changes into the Holy Church. English and the other modern languages were only *permitted* by Vatican II, he points

out; they were *not mandated*. The Chairman will send a xerox copy of this excellent editorial to anyone who mails him a self-addressed stamped envelope. If anyone can demonstrate how the present state of affairs can be squared with the letter of Vatican II's Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy, please send copies of such a dissertation to the Chairman and Mr. Hallett.

A letter from the LLA Chairman congratulating the *Register* and Hallett for the editorial was printed on page 4 of the December 25, 1987 issue. It was introduced by the headline "Hurray for Latin". Alas, some misinformed editor changed the Chairman's correct *Pietro* Cardinal Palazzini to the absurd *Ermanno* Cardinal Palazzini. The following week, the same newspaper published a diatribe against Latin Liturgy from a Mr. D.B. at the end of the world (Grand Rapids, Michigan); he wrote, among other things, "Latin is a dead language, let's keep it in the graveyard. . . The 'liturgical revolution' was, and is, the work of the Holy Spirit. . . Is he [Paul Hallett] a disciple of Archbishop Marcel Lefebvre?"

8. The article "That Good Old Tridentine Mass" by our member Charlotte Low appeared on pages 13-18 of the September, 1987 issue of *Crisis* magazine. It is a lively account of her visits to various "Tridentine" chapels and Mass centers throughout the country; she also reports on places where the old Mass was celebrated with the permission of the authorities.
9. An author writing under the pseudonym Lord Acton produced an essay "Empty Liturgies" in the November, 1986 issue of *Crisis* (pp. 12-17). It attacks the vernacular liturgy; the following passages give the flavor of the article:

This ancient inheritance has been sacked. The new liturgy no longer reflects the ages. It is a mirror of its age.

Natural law is gone from the new liturgy. So is the hierarchy of being. So is order, purpose, and ancient and medieval history. The Catholic church, in its new liturgy, is closer to modern Methodism than to its own Catholic traditions. One could never imagine from the new liturgy an achievement comparable to Solesmes, Rouen, Chartres, Cologne, St. Peter's, or St. Mark's in Venice. The new liturgy could inspire no such thing. Its sensibility is strictly Lion's Club and Little League picnic. ("The five-thirty cafe is open after Mass with refreshments and a chance to enjoy one another's company.")

The people by their actions form the new liturgy; the old liturgy "formed" the people. The old liturgy was larger than we, greater than we, wiser than we. We tried to reach up to understand it, to let it in, to let it shape us. We did not think we could "compose" it. Its purpose was not so that it could express our thoughts and feelings. Its purpose was to teach us the classic ways to think and to feel. The old liturgy was a teacher, the new a piece of kindergarten putty.

One thing the old liturgy did not do. Never of itself did it distract us from its relentless focus upon the transcendence of God and eternity, beyond the vicissitudes of time.

Everywhere (even in restaurants) one overhears Catholics talking about the shallowness of the new liturgy.

It is not clear what Lord Acton has to do with all of this; it was a poor choice of pseudonym.

10. In the Fall, 1987 issue of *Sacred Music*, our member Duane L. C. M. Galles has an article "Washington Sunday Morning" that describes the regular 10 AM Latin Sunday High Mass at St. Matthew's Cathedral in Washington, DC. On the October morning when Mr. Galles attended, the celebrant was the Pro-Nuncio. The Papal ambassador was greeted with Luther's "A Mighty Fortress"; the *Graduale Romanum* is not used.
11. The Dom Mocquereau Foundation has published a booklet, *An Interview with Dr. Alfred Tomatis*, who had cured a French monastery by ordering the monks to go back to Gregorian Chant. After Vatican II, a new abbot, itching after novelties, had introduced an all-French liturgy, abolished the vegetarian diet, and increased the number of hours of sleep. Soon, however, he had to summon the doctor, because 70 of the 90 monks were "slumping in their cells like wet dishrags". Dr. Tomatis prescribed the re-introduction of the Latin Chant, and in nine months, all was well. Members who had attended the National Convention (or who had bought the tapes) will recall that Dr. Marier discussed this case in his Saturday afternoon lecture on the state of plainchant. He has supplied the Chairman with some of these booklets. If you want one, send the Chairman a self-addressed stamped (39¢) long envelope.
12. In his book review "Nobody Leaves the Church" of Peter Occhiogrosso's *Once a Catholic* in the October 11 issue of the *New York Times Book Review*, John Leo, formerly editor of *Commonweal*, wrote:

A surprising number of those inter-

viewed wanted to talk about the loss of the Latin mass. Like most pageants mounted by the bookish, the new vernacular mass turned out rather badly in language, tone and staging. The artist Thomas Lanigan-Schmidt complains: "They wanted to make it conceptual instead of an experience. It's a theory Mass now." Michael Novak says, "Now we endure the Liturgy of Happy Talk and Forced Cheerfulness." Mr. Novak even finds a dollop of de facto ageism in the reform: a folk mass can be moving in a small room full of college students, but "it's very hard to live on when you're fifty." All this may pass, but at the moment it breeds great nostalgia for the mass that bored so many Catholics in the first place. As Mary Gordon says, "Better to get stuck in the thirteenth century than in 1965; better to get stuck in 'Pange Lingua' than 'Blowin in the Wind.'" But she admits to some ambivalence: "The trouble with the church now is that anybody who wants to retain the old ritual also seems to want to invade El Salvador."

13. The last page of "The Week in Review" section of the *New York Times*, Sunday, September 20, 1987, carried the article "How Some American Catholics See John Paul II's Visit". Nine well-known Catholics gave their impressions; the following excerpt is from the utterances of William Alfred, Harvard humanities professor and playwright, whose works include "Hogan's Goat":

If I were the Pope, I would restore fixed Lent regulations. I would also restore the Latin Mass, because the Latin Mass can also be followed by a missal, as it always was, in the native language.

14. The Christmas issue of the *National Catholic Register* carried the article "Lefebvrites are gaining in Gabon" on page 3. Bishop Felicien-Patrice Makouaka of Franceville, Gabon, perhaps on an *ad limina Apostolorum* visit in Rome, is quoted as having said, "Despite our being on guard, and our calls to unity and to community with Peter, a good number of the faithful regularly frequent the community of St. Pius X at Libreville. . . This is a great pain for us."
15. On Wednesday, December 2, the *Education* section of the *New York Times* published the story "Fresh Techniques Breathe Life into Latin", which describes the reintroduction of Latin studies in American schools. Enrollment in Latin courses in colleges is now stable at 25,000; in high schools, the figure went from 702,000 in 1962 to 150,000 in 1976 to 177,000 in 1986. There is a shortage of qualified Latin teachers in schools where it is taught to

elementary school students. Among the authorities quoted in the article is LLA member William A. Torchia, Jr., Philadelphia's Latin specialist.

Newsworthy Items

1. Mr. Michael J. Garber reports from the Diocese of Colorado Springs:

I am sorry to report that nothing has been done this year to advance the Latin Liturgy in Colorado Springs. As our Bishop desires that the majority of parishes in the city be lay-run, he has been moving priests from city parishes to the country. Now, three or four parishes among the city's ten have no resident priests. At these parishes, I am given to understand that on most Sundays there is no Mass, only several communion services. Priests visit only periodically. With such conditions prevailing, even priests sympathetic to our cause cannot be persuaded to offer mass in Latin.

2. Mr. Theodore L. Cover, LLA Chairman in St. Louis, writes:

Our two Jesuit Scholastics reported two very interesting things. First, to further their Latin studies they had to take courses at nearby nonsectarian Washington University. Catholic St. Louis University no longer offers advanced Latin courses. And, where do you think most of their fellow students at the class come from? Concordia Seminary (Lutheran-Missouri Synod) and Eden Theological Seminary (Presbyterian).

3. In a front page interview in the October 18, 1987 issue of the *National Catholic Register*, our member John Agresto, deputy chairman of the National Endowment for the Humanities, was quoted as saying:

After Vatican II, the Church almost completely turned its back on 2,000 years of liturgical development. The Church must **never** forget its obligation as a bearer of culture.

4. Mr. William G. Previn, Choir Director at St. Colette Church in Livonia, Michigan, has been trying to reintroduce some of our Latin musical heritage into his parish. He makes the following inquiry, and the Chairman hopes that one of our members may be able to help him.

There is a Mass that the St. Lawrence (Detroit) Choir did 23-24 years ago that I've been trying to locate and so far have been unsuccessful. I've tried various publishers and local experts with no luck. The Mass was written by Vito Carnevale (I'm not sure of the

spelling) and began with soprano chant of the Kyrie with the altos, tenors, and basses responding. If you have any knowledge of this Mass or a source so I can continue my search, please let me know.

5. Bishop John Sherlock of London, Ontario and Fr. David Przedwiecki of the Franciscan Friars of Mary Immaculate celebrated a Latin Mass on the Feast of the Assumption, 1987, at St. Peter's Church, north of Lucan, Ontario.
6. In a letter to the synod of Bishops dated October 25, 1987, Dr. Eric Maria de Saventem, President of *Una Voce*, wrote, on behalf of the thirty-five national delegates attending their tenth biennial General Assembly in Rome:

Any reform accomplished at the price of disregarding almost the whole of the liturgical history of Christendom must fail. We see now in the Church evident signs of such failure.

Unless the reformed rites are the embodiment of a different faith, the continuance of the classical liturgy cannot be seen in any way as a threat to them. Well-documented reports from all over the world reveal that in practice the reforms are so perceived and applied.

7. Our member Mr. James Bourgeois writes that during a recent trip to the Netherlands, he attended a Latin High Mass at the Basilica of Our Lady in Maastricht.

Much to my delight, the schedule listed a Latin High Mass at 10 AM Sunday morning. My expectations were not disappointed. The choir was fine, the acoustics of the church grand, the Mass of Paul VI celebrated with dignity and beauty. There was even a white-gloved halberdier (the sacristan?) dressed in frock coat and plumed bicorne to lead the procession. The capacity congregation heartily participated in the singing of the *Gloria*, the *Credo*, and the *Pater Noster*. I believe you would classify this Mass as hybrid since the Propers, the Prayers of the Faithful, and, of course, the homily, were in the vernacular. I left the Basilica feeling close to the beauties and mysteries of God. How fortunate that I noticed the Mass schedule; how sad that I had to travel thousands of miles to experience such a beautiful rite.

8. Fr. Jeffrey L'Arche, M.S., wrote to the Chairman:

The Latin Tridentine Mass at Our Lady of Sorrows Church, Hartford,

- Connecticut is entering its third year. The average attendance is 150 people. It is celebrated on the first Sunday of the month at 5:00 PM. The congregation is a mixture that includes young and professional people from a wide region including surrounding dioceses and the state of Massachusetts. A variety of church choirs and scholas have volunteered their services for the sung liturgy. Choirs from out of state as well as local parishes have participated in addition to music groups from the Harrt School of Music and St. Gregory's Society associated with Yale University. From Eastern Connecticut have come high school Latin classes who experience the spoken language for the first time.
9. Mr. David Dunkle, formerly Director of Music at St. Philomena's Church in Cleveland (the only church in Cleveland with an unbroken tradition of a Latin High Mass), is now associated with St. Monica's Church, 413 East 79th Street, New York City, NY 10021. He writes:
- St. Monica's Church in Manhattan would like to form a Gregorian schola and polyphonic choir to perform the great motets and Mass settings from the Renaissance. While the Mass is not in Latin, that could be a possibility in the future. Interested persons should contact Mr. David Dunkle at (212) BU-8-6250.
10. A convention of "Traditional" Roman Catholics took place in Phoenix, Arizona in September, 1987. Represented at this gathering was the North Carolina based "Society of Traditional Roman Catholics". The group organized itself under a national director. They want an independent "Tridentine Latin Rite". The head of the group is Msgr. Raymond Ruscitto, Box 455, Kingsburg, California 93631.
11. On December 5, 1987, the Latin Mass at St. Agatha's Church in St. Louis, Missouri, featured the SIU-Edwardsville Concert Chorale under the direction of Dr. Leonard Van Camp. The setting of the Mass was "O Quam Gloriosum Est Regnum" by Tomas Luis De Victoria.
12. A well-informed correspondent reports that in November, 1986, a commission of seven cardinals (Mayer, Gantin, Innocenti, Casaroli, Ratzinger, Stickler, and Gagnon) examined the question of the old liturgy and recommended to the Pope that it be made freely available to those who wanted it, but the French bishops made representations against this finding.

13. A recent issue of the "Traditionalist" newspaper *The Remnant* published a letter to the Pontiff purporting to be from a retired Bishop calling for the erection of a separate "Tridentine Latin Rite" for those who want the old ceremonies. A knowledgeable Canadian has informed the Chairman that this possibility has indeed been investigated by the Roman Curia. The idea was endorsed by Fr. Franz Schmidberger, Superior General of the Society of St. Pius X, in a letter to friends and benefactors dated October 11, 1987. The text of the bishop's letter follows:

His Holiness
Pope John Paul II
The Vatican

Your Holiness,

Your gracious gesture two years ago in granting the American Hierarchy permission to restore the Traditional Tridentine Latin Mass in their dioceses met with failure. Very few bishops granted the permission.

Again your Episcopacy lacked a true Mother's concern for hundreds of thousands of her children. Two hundred years old Eastern Rites are permitted, yet those of the five hundred years old Tridentine Rite are treated as second class Catholics. We believe the last and only solution is to relieve the American Bishops of this problem, as they will no longer accept any further such efforts, I assure you.

Your Holiness, a simple solution, and one that we are sure you have already envisioned, and for which there is strong precedent, is the establishment of a distinct TRIDENTINE LATIN RITE in the United States.

The Eastern Rites, living in peace with our U.S. Hierarchy, already have over 700,000 souls, twelve dioceses, two archbishops, nine diocesan bishops, and over 500 priests. We are sure that the majority of our ordinaries in the United States would thank you for such a simple solution. This would make an asset out of a liability.

For the establishment of the Tridentine Rite for the United States, may we humbly suggest that, in time, an archbishop and two regional auxiliaries be named, as with the Maronites, where their ordinary is in New York and an auxiliary in California. Our proposed three bishops during the initial and difficult stage would:

1. maintain needed common policy to unite divergent Tridentine Faithful

until they were more firmly established;

2. meet on an equal basis with every other U.S. diocesan ordinary;

3. supervise the return to episcopal guidance of all those self-sacrificing priests who for twenty years served thousands and thousands of the Tridentine faithful;

4. seek willing priests, retired or active, from the existing dioceses, who, with the permission of their ordinaries might favor the Tridentine Rite, but without loss of retirement benefits.

Thus the Church would show her motherly love for those abandoned and neglected souls, and time, I am sure, would heal many wounds; bring quiet and peace, show an increase in vocations; a much greater fidelity to Your Holiness; a revival of the beauty and dignity of the Gregorian; a return to the "*lex credendi lex orandi*". We know over 300,000 lay people and some 300 priests would thank you.

I enclose a 30-page Catholic Traditionalist Directory of 243 Chapels and Churches, built or bought in the U.S. by lay Catholics. We must add to this another 100 whose pastors cannot afford to list for fear of reprisal by their diocesan ordinaries. Also, add to this the enclosed list of 80 parishes under 40 Pius X priests. In round numbers, Your Holiness, over 300 parishes, 300 priests and over 300,000 Catholic lay people.

The extraordinary news is the growing attendance of younger married couples and their children—a portent for the future.

I have personally contacted five outstanding Archbishops across the United States; two in the Southeast, two in the Midwest and one in the Southwest. Three are most enthusiastic and very much in favor of a separate Tridentine Latin Rite, concerned that so many lay Catholics have been suffering for over 20 years. The other two Archbishops were hesitant.

May God and Our Blessed Mother guide you this Marian year in your decisions and in your travels. You are daily in the prayers and Masses and esteem of this 80-year-old Bishop.

In Ipso oremus pro invicem,

Signed

14. The Department of Greek and Latin of the Catholic University of America has informed the Chairman that it is offering full

tuition scholarships to promising students who enroll at the University with the intention of majoring in Latin or Greek. The awards are based on an examination given to those who have studied Latin for at least two years in high school. For information, write or call Professor Mantello, CUA, Washington, DC 20064 (1-202-635-5216).

15. Former Governor Jerry Brown of California was an ABC guest commentator in San Francisco during the Pope's visit there. Among his utterances was one on the liturgical reform:
- "What is so striking is that the falloff in Catholic participation appears to be correlated with the innovations . . ."
- "Ritual to be ritual has to be invariable. And it draws a lot of its power from the fact that it is repeated without change for a long time, and it has been in the context of the central experiences of life — birth, baptism, marriage, reconciliation, Mass, death. And as you start tinkering with these things, you start upsetting the confidence that people have invested in them at a very deep, perhaps unconscious, level."
16. The Bishop of Buffalo has allowed an old rite Mass to be celebrated at St. Matthew's Church, 26 Wyoming Avenue, Buffalo on February 27, 1988.
17. The Niagara Latin Community celebrated Christmas with a 10 AM Latin Mass (old rite) sung by Fr. David Przedwiecki, OFMI of Lucan, Ontario.
18. The Latin Mass and Vespers were sung every day in the octave of Christmas at St. Agnes Church in St. Paul; the church was recently restored in the Austrian rococo style in celebration of its centennial.
19. Christopher Schaefer reports that the last time the Catholic Choral Heritage Society of Connecticut sang was at Easter, 1987, when some members joined with the schola at St. Peter Church in New Britain to sing the chants from the 1511 *Graduale Pataviense*. The schola also sang polyphonic pieces from Heinrich Isaac's *Choralis Constantinus*, alternated with organ versets by Hans Buchner. A new organ was dedicated during this 10 AM Mass.
20. Congratulations to our member Fr. Eugene R. Winkoski, who has been appointed pastor of St. Wenceslaus Parish in Chicago.
21. Mr. Carl G. Moore, Jr., a member of the Association, sang with the local choir at the Latin Requiem Mass for Mr. Joseph Gangemi at 8 PM on November 22, 1987 at

St. Joseph's Church in Wilmington, Delaware.

22. The following list displays the orchestral music at the Latin Solemn High Masses at St. Agnes Church in St. Paul, Minnesota during the 1987-1988 season.
- Sunday, October 4, 1987. 10 AM
Joseph Haydn, Heilig Mass
- Sunday, October 11, 1987. 4 PM
Centennial celebration of founding of Saint Agnes Parish
Ludwig van Beethoven, Mass in C
- Sunday, October 18, 1987. 10 AM
Franz Schubert, Mass in B-flat
- Thursday, October 22, 1987. 7:30 PM
Mass for Friends of the Chorale
W. A. Mozart, Coronation Mass (K 317)
- Sunday, October 25, 1987. 10 AM
Joseph Haydn, Mariazeller Mass
- Sunday, November 1, 1987. 10 AM
Feast of All Saints
Joseph Haydn, Pauken Mass
- Monday, November 2, 1987. 7:30 PM
All Souls' Day
W. A. Mozart, Requiem Mass (K 626)
- Sunday, November 8, 1987. 10 AM
Joseph Haydn, Theresien Mass
- Sunday, November 15, 1987. 10 AM
W. A. Mozart, Waisenhaus Mass (K 139)
- Sunday, November 22, 1987. 10 AM
Feast of Christ the King
Joseph Haydn, Lord Nelson Mass
- Sunday: Nov. 29, Dec. 6, 13, 20. 10 AM
On these Sundays of Advent, Gregorian chant will be sung at the solemn Mass
- Thursday, December 24, 1987. 11:30 PM
Feast of Christmas
Ludwig van Beethoven, Mass in C
- Sunday, December 27, 1987. 10 AM
Joseph Haydn, Heilig Mass
- Friday January 1, 1988. 10 AM
W. A. Mozart, Piccolomini Mass (K 258)
- Sunday, January 3, 1988. 10 AM
Feast of the Epiphany
Joseph Haydn, Lord Nelson Mass
- Sunday, January 10, 1988. 10 AM
Joseph Haydn, Harmonie Mass
- Sunday, January 17, 1988. 10 AM
Franz Schubert, Mass in B-flat
- Sunday, January 24, 1988. 10 AM
Feast of Saint Agnes
Charles Gounod, Mass of Saint Cecilia

Sunday, January 31, 1988. 10 AM
W. A. Mozart, Trinitatis Mass (K 167)

Sunday, February 7, 1988. 10 AM
Joseph Haydn, Pauken Mass

Sunday, February 14, 1988. 10 AM
Joseph Haydn, Theresien Mass

Sunday, Feb. 21, 28, March 6, 10 AM
On these Sundays of Lent, Gregorian chant will be sung at the solemn Mass.

Sunday, March 13, 1988. 10 AM
Forty Hours Eucharistic Devotion
Franz Schubert, Mass in C.

Sunday, March 20, 27, 1988. 10 AM
On these Sundays of Lent Gregorian chant will be sung at the solemn Mass.

Sunday, April 3, 1988. 10 AM
Easter Sunday
Luigi Cherubini, Fourth Mass in C

Sunday, April 10, 1988. 10 AM
W. A. Mozart, Trinitatis Mass (K 167)

Sunday, April 17, 1988. 10 AM
Franz Schubert, Mass in C

Sunday, April 24, 1988. 10 AM
Joseph Haydn, Little Organ-solo Mass

Sunday, May 1, 1988. 10 AM
Franz Schubert, Mass in G

Sunday, May 8, 1988. 10 AM
Joseph Haydn, Mariazeller Mass

Sunday, May 15, 1988. 10 AM
W. A. Mozart, Mass in C (K 337)

Sunday, May 22, 1988. 10 AM
Pentecost Sunday
Joseph Haydn, Harmonie Mass

Sunday, May 29, 1988. 10 AM
Trinity Sunday
Joseph Haydn, Schopfungs Mass

Sunday, June 5, 1988. 10 AM
Feast of Corpus Christi
W. A. Mozart, Coronation Mass (K 317)

The Leaflet Missal Company, 419 W. Minnehaha Avenue, St. Paul, MN 55103 has produced three cassettes of the Christmas, Easter, and Pentecost Masses at St. Agnes; the music is Gounod's Mass in Honor of St. Cecilia, Haydn's Paukenmesse, and Beethoven's Mass in C respectively. These sound recordings cost \$31.95 for the complete set, postage included. Minnesota residents add 6% sales tax.

23. San Francisco's *Chanticleer*, "America's premier male vocal ensemble", gave a concert of Christmas music at St. Ignatius Church in San Francisco on December 12; they sang the Mass for Christmas Day (*Puer natus est*), chanting the Ordinary (Mass V) and singing the Propers from the

music of William Byrd.

- 24. Most Rev. Bishop Edward Head of Buffalo has granted permission to Fr. Edward Grosz to celebrate a Latin Mass (1962 Missal) at 10:30 AM on Saturday, February 27, 1988 at St. Matthew's Church, 26 Wyoming Avenue, in Buffalo. There is a "Western New York Latin Mass Committee" which appears to work in cooperation with Canadian *Una Voce* in spreading the word about these old rite Masses. Its chairman is a Mr. Albert Huntz (1-716-834-1370).
- 25. On Sunday, December 13, 1987, the Latin Mass was celebrated by Fr. Paul Raftery, O.P., at the Church of Sts. Peter and Paul, 1946 East Lee, Tucson, AZ 85719, at 11:00 AM. The Mass was accompanied by Gregorian chant sung by a group of students from the University of Arizona Newman Center. The church was full, and much enthusiasm was expressed by those in attendance. Father Raftery, who is one of the chaplains at the University of Arizona, celebrates the Latin Mass from time to time at the Newman Center and, by invitation, at nearby parishes.
- 26. Congratulations to our member Fr. James P. O'Reilly, M.S., who celebrated his golden anniversary in the priesthood with a community Mass on December 18 at which the ordinary was chanted in Latin. Fr. O'Reilly was ordained in St. John Lateran, Rome in 1937 by Luigi Traglia, vice-regent and later Cardinal and Dean of the Sacred College. He strongly recommends the Scanlon and Scanlon *Latin Grammar* and writes, "I remain more convinced than ever that the future success of the LLA requires that we do everything we can to promote the study of Latin among seminarians, priests, religious, and laity."
- 27. Show this to the next fellow who tells you that Vatican II abolished Latin.

The Second Vatican Council And Latin

The following are statements from several Conciliar Constitutions calling for the preservation and use of the Latin language and tradition.

From the Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy;

art. 36. . . "Particular law remaining in force, the use of the Latin language is to be preserved in the Latin rites."

art. 54 "Steps should be taken so that the faithful may also be able to say or sing together in Latin those parts of the Ordinary of the Mass which pertain to them."

art. 114. . . "The treasure of sacred music is to be preserved and fostered

with very great care."

art. 116. . . "The Church acknowledges Gregorian Chant as proper to the Roman Liturgy. Therefore, other things being equal, it should be given pride of place in liturgical services.

From the Decree on Priestly Formation:

art. 13. . . ". . . they (seminarians) should acquire a command of Latin which will enable them to understand and use the source material of so many sciences and the documents of the Church as well. The study of the liturgical language proper to each rite is to be regarded as necessary, while a suitable knowledge of the languages of sacred scripture and of the sources of tradition should be strongly encouraged."

From *The Documents of Vatican II*, Abbott, S.J., Walter M.; Guild Press, 1966.

Additions And Corrections To The Latin Mass Directory

MASSACHUSETTS Archdiocese of Boston

The regular third Thursday Mass has been shifted from the Newton campus of Boston College to Holy Trinity Church, 140 Shawmut Avenue, Boston 02118.

ILLINOIS Archdiocese of Chicago

St. John Cantius
825 Carpenter Street
Chicago, IL 60622
(8 blocks N. of Madison Street, near Milwaukee Avenue) 2nd Sunday of the month at 12:15 (Gregorian Chant)
Celebrant: Fr. Frank Phillips, C.R.

CALIFORNIA Diocese of San Bernardino

The First Friday Mass at St. Frances X. Cabrini Church in Yucaipa is celebrated at 7:30 AM. Despite the early hour, 100 souls attend regularly.

MARYLAND Archdiocese of Washington

The Latin Mass at the Carroll Manor Chapel (1962 Missal) is said *versus populum* because most of the old high altar was taken down. A moveable altar is used.

PENNSYLVANIA Diocese of Allentown

The weekday Masses at St. Mary's Cistercian Priory in New Ringgold are now, according to Mr. Carl G. Moore, Jr., in English "because of monks being away for studies".

MISSOURI

Archdiocese of St. Louis

Immaculate Conception Church
15th and Baugh
East St. Louis, Missouri
Sunday at 11:00 AM

St. Agatha's Church
In addition to the old rite Mass already listed, there is now a Latin High Mass on the fourth Sunday of the month at 10:00 AM where the new Missal is followed. The Proper, however, is in English since the celebrant, Msgr. Granich, does not own a complete Latin Sunday Missal.

OHIO

Diocese of Cleveland

The Latin High Mass is no longer celebrated at St. Philomena's Church. The new pastor has evidently stopped it, and the choir director as a result has quit and taken work in New York City. The singers have moved to another church. (See next entry.) "And behold, there arose a new king in Egypt who did not know Joseph. . ."

Diocese of Cleveland

Immaculate Conception Parish
4129 Superior Avenue
Cleveland, OH 44103
Latin High Mass Sundays at 12:30 is sung by a polyphonic and Gregorian schola under the direction of Fr. John Hayes. There will also be some evening Latin High Masses (e.g., Immaculate Conception, Christmas Eve).

Local Chapters

Boston

About 50 people attended the October 15 Latin Mass sponsored by the Boston Chapter at Holy Trinity Church in the South End. On November 19, the Mass and meeting took place at the chapel on the Newton Campus of Boston College. There was no meeting in December.

On Sunday, November 22, the chapter's choir, the *Schola Amicorum* gave a chant concert followed by Latin Vespers and Benediction at Holy Trinity Church. Beginning in January, the Latin Mass on the third Thursday of the month will be shifted to Holy Trinity Church permanently. Attendance is greater there than at the Boston College Chapel, and the church is a more aesthetically pleasing place, since the chapel is a modernistic concoction.

Detroit

We need new officers for this chapter. Volunteers please come forward.

Hartford

The Chairman has accepted the resignations of the officers of this chapter, and hereby appoints Dr. Richard P. Waido, 737 Farmington Avenue, West Hartford, CT 06119 (1-203-236-3680) to be the new chairman.

New Orleans

The office of chapter chairman is declared vacant.

New York

High Mass was sung in Latin at 7 PM on Christmas Eve. The chapter held a Christmas Party following the regular Latin High Mass at 5 PM the following Sunday.

San Diego

In addition to the regular weekly old rite Latin Masses, the local chapter sponsored the following Latin Masses according to the revised Roman Missal during 1987.

18 June: Our Mother of Confidence, celebrating the Feast of Corpus Christi.

16 July: Our Mother of Confidence, celebrating the Feast of Our Lady of Mount Carmel.

21 Sept.: The Little Flower Haven, celebrating the Feast of St. Mathew.

2 Nov.: The Little Flower Haven, celebrating All Souls Day.

6 Dec.: The Little Flower Haven, celebrating Advent.

The spiritual director is Msgr. Tullio Andreatta, a Knight of the Holy Sepulchre.

* * *

Letters

26 Calumet Ave.
Worcester, MA 01606
November 29, 1987

Prof. Dr. Anthony Lo Bello
Dept. of Mathematics
Allegheny College
Meadville, PA 16335

Dear Prof. Dr. Lo Bello:

There has been another solemn profession in the diocese of Worcester, MA, with the added solemnity of Latin and Gregorian chant. This time three Benedictine monks (a priest and two brothers) were professed to Pluscarden Abbey in Scotland but with continued residence at St. Mary's Monastery in Petersham, MA, as a parallel community to the nearby Benedictine nuns of St. Scholastica's Priory, best-known for their publishing venture of St. Bede's Publications.

In attendance were two bishops (the ordinary and auxiliary of the diocese of Worcester), six abbots (the Benedictine abbot of Pluscarden Abbey in Scotland, who received the professions, the Benedictine abbot of St. Anselm's Abbey in Manchester, NH, who preached the sermon at Mass on the three Benedictine vows of stability, obedience and conversion of life, two other Benedictine abbots, and two Trappist abbots from St. Joseph's Abbey in Spencer, MA), the Benedictine prioress of St. Scholastica's Priory, the Benedictine prior of St. Benedict Priory in Still River, MA (the solemn profession of whom I mentioned in my previous letter, and from whose priory originally came the Benedictine monks and nuns of Petersham), and other priests, religious and laity. The service was held in Our Lady Immaculate Church, a parish church in Athol,

MA, a community adjacent to Petersham, and indicative of the consecration of the monastic communities to the Immaculate Heart of Mary.

As seen from the program, the Latin parts of the Mass were sung by the 23 nuns and novices of St. Scholastica's Priory (with an average age of under 35) or by the three monks of St. Mary's monastery augmented by other Benedictine and Trappist monks present as well as by the congregation at the appropriate places. The Liturgy of the Eucharist (including the preface and Eucharist Prayer II) was sung in Latin (rather than in English as the text implies).

There will be another Benedictine "social event" upcoming—namely, the priestly ordination of one of the recently solemnly-professed brothers of St. Benedict Priory at a local parish church. The service will take place on Saturday, December 12, the feast of Our Lady of Guadalupe, which has significance to St. Benedict Priory as well as to the two Benedictine communities in Petersham.

Sincerely,
Thomas Syseskey

Postscript of the Chairman: St. Mary's will be a dependent house of Pluscarden Abbey, which is a member of the Subiaco Congregation. St. Benedict Priory at Still River belongs to the Swiss-American congregation. Fr. Karam is a bi-ritual priest (Latin and Maronite rites) who is chaplain at Sancta Scholastica Priory in Petersham. Pluscarden Abbey was founded from Prinknash Abbey in England, which itself came into being when the Anglican Benedictines of the Caldey Islands entered the Catholic Church as a group in the beginning of this century.

* * *

1390 Market St. (1727)
San Francisco, CA 94102
Dec. 3, 1987

Dr. Anthony Lo Bello
Allegheny College
Meadville, PA
Dear Dr. Lo Bello,

A few notes on the Sunday liturgy at St. Mary's Cathedral here in San Francisco, "for your information". The music program under John Balka is festive and imaginative, and congregational involvement is vigorous. Latin texts are heard frequently from the cantors and the choir; and occasionally the congregation is included in something non-vernacular, like the Kyrie. Recently, the Sanctus and Agnus Dei have become standard congregational repertoire.

Until recently, over a period of three years or more, Archbishop Quinn made a consistent tradition of singing his pontifical blessing in Latin; and the responses to his versicles had become increasingly familiar. Since Pentecost, he has returned to English.

But in October, on the Sunday before Columbus Day, the Archbishop celebrated Mass with a visiting choir from Genoa. Without warning, after the Offertory, he sang the solemn-tone "*Dominus vobiscum*", and Alcuin's Preface of the Trinity, then proceeded to recite the Roman canon, all in Latin. It was a nice surprise, and I sent him a note of appreciation.

I think this hybrid arrangement represents a healthy order of priorities, in a parish context. Since the liturgy is generally intelligible, the ordinary citizen can relate to these Latin episodes more easily than in former days. The Tridentine program tended to be sublime in theory, and depressing in practice. If the Latin heritage survives in the setting of a functional liturgy, we will have the best of both worlds.

Sincerely,
Clarence Zaar

* * *

ST. ANSELM'S ABBEY
4501 South Dakota Avenue, N.E.
Washington, D.C. 20017
(202) 269-2300

December 5, 1987
Prof. Dr. Anthony Lo Bello
Allegheny College
Meadville, PA 16335

Dear Prof. Lo Bello,

I spent several days at our sister abbey of the English Benedictine Congregation at Portsmouth, Rhode Island, and made an overnight trip from there to Petersham, Massachusetts, northeast of Worcester. And before going to Hartford I was some days at Bethlehem, Connecticut, at the Abbey of Regina Laudis.

At Regina Laudis the community numbers about forty, and they have never changed over from Latin to the vernacular in all the years since about 1949; there are now some lay men and women who come faithfully to the Abbey for weekly chant practice and who sing with the Sisters on Sundays and Feast Days for Mass and Vespers. The Solesmes Graduale and Antiphonale books are used throughout; Dr. Theodore Marier has visited the Abbey often and there are few Benedictine houses anywhere in which the Divine Office and daily Eucharist are more reverently done. There is no organ in the Abbey church; at Mass and office one of the nuns gives the first three notes of intonations with a harp; at Benediction before Sunday Vespers there may sometimes be a polyphonic motet.

St. Scholastica Priory at Petersham is the community of women who were for some years at Still River, Massachusetts; there were a few less than thirty Sisters in chapel at their manor house when I was there, and for morning office, Conventual Mass, and Vespers the Sisters are joined by members of St. Mary's Priory community of men, six or eight strong. Here the Superior, Fr. Cyril, has introduced a few items of vernacular hymnody,

but the Proper of the Mass is chanted very well from the Solesmes Graduale, and the Latin prevails throughout the service. The Sisters have built buildings to carry on the work of their St. Bede Press, and the bakery business has grown so much that several lay women from the neighborhood come to help with the work.

It would be better if members from these two communities would themselves give details of their work that is so much in accord with the aims of the Latin Liturgy Association. But in any case, they should be given credit for carrying on faithfully work that has been sadly neglected in so many of our Benedictine houses of men in this country.

Your Friend,

Fr. Urban Schnaus, O.S.B.

* * *

A Story of the Implementation of the Indult in the Diocese of X

The Chairman recently received two letters from a member with an account of Masses celebrated under the 1984 Indult. The Chairman publishes them as a pathetic description of one aspect of Catholic life in these times. He has not made what many will consider necessary editorial corrections in order that the spirit of the documents might be preserved; all names, however, have been suppressed.

Letter 1

Well I guess you want to hear about the Mass Sunday that Bishop M said for us, the papal indult Mass; there were only around 150 people there. I brought the vestments, Roman style, the cope and veil for benediction, a cassock for Father G, a couple of extra stoles, missal, epistle and gospel book, and altar boy cards, so there could be no excuse for not having everything. Of course nobody would open a door or help me carry the items to the Sacristy, good traditionalist! When Father G (he is the head of the liturgical department in the diocese) saw these things, *eyebrows were raised!* He said, "And what are all these things for?" I said, "Bishop M is going to wear the vestments and cope for Benediction; he said, 'I told you, you can't have Benediction after Mass.'" I said, "Father, would you deprive the people of grace?" He said, "The Mass contains more than enough grace." I said, "Well, Bishop M said he would." Then the bishop's assistant priest said, "The Bishop said he is going to have Benediction." Father G said, "We will see. I'll talk to him." I put the altar cards on the altar and told Father G that there was only one altar cloth on the altar and there should be three; the Bishop's assistant priest told me, "Well, that's what you are going to use; be thankful the Bishop is letting you use the church as it is!" I could see we were not going

to get along! Father G asked how many candles were on the altar. I said four, for a Bishop's low Mass, and the young priest took the modern candles off the table altar and placed them on the old high altar, where there were four beautiful old silver candlesticks, but we could not use them and had to be satisfied with the new table ones with glass globes around them, something that you would see on Williamsburg fireplace mantles!

Father G asked what Sunday this was. I said that it was the fifteenth Sunday after Pentecost. As he was bringing the Dominican Missal and saw that I had the missal all set up as it should be, he got mad and said, "How do you know?" I said, "I do not know if the collect from the vigil of St. Matthew is supposed to be said." He said, "Don't worry about that. Are we having music?" I did not know that there was an organist; it was a low Mass. Father G said to me, "You think you know everything! I don't like your attitude." Well, I did know most of the things pertaining to the liturgy, as I had helped our own priest when we had the Old Mass and picked up on various things, besides reading and asking and finding out about others. Well, it was obvious we clashed. He told me, "You know, you are not following my orders; you must learn **obedience!** Everything must go through me," and it went on and on, so I was glad when A.H. walked in. I started to tell him about the trouble I was having; he told me to stay until Bishop M came into the sacristy, but I said, "I want to go and start the Rosary, or nobody else will do it," so I went out. I was very careful about the intentions. Nobody said this time I could not offer it for something, so I offered it for the poor souls, the religious, and for personal and private intentions. As I was saying the Rosary, I noticed the Bishop's assistant priest put out the Monstrance, and so I knew I had won out on that one; we were going to have Benediction! God was by my side!

Well, Father F from X came and served as altar boy along with Father G, but Father G told me in the sacristy that he was going to give out Holy Communion along with the Bishop. I had brought an extra green stole to match the Bishop's vestments, and Father G said, "I will need it." Well, he lost out on that also; Father F gave out Holy Communion instead. Oh boy! There were more mistakes this time than ever before, right from the beginning, and to think that Bishop M offered it the first time for us two years ago with a few mistakes then, but many more now, from forgetting to say Kyrie three times to signs of the cross to more than I care to list, as it would fill half of this page. Even when Father F read the Gospel in English for the people, he forgot to read the Epistle, although the Bishop did read both in Latin! Bishop M gave the sermon, but only a few subtle hints were thrown our way to try to get us to accept everything in the new rite and

be tolerant of those who wish to worship that way and to be satisfied whenever we get the old Mass and not to make waves; this was the first time in three Masses they did not really yell at us, but I wonder if it was because a man said he was bringing a tape recorder to tape what they would say for the people?

I noticed people receiving Holy Communion in the hand!!! There were no prayers after low Mass although I had brought the card. The Bishop changed vestments right at the altar; we had no candelabra, just the regular candles that were lit for low Mass, and you know they had candelabrams. Father G took the cope I brought and put it on the Bishop. It was the Blessed Mother cope; he liked it very much. Of course there were the usual questions, "Where did I get it?" I know how to avoid answers. I should have said, "You priests throw everything out; that's how I got it," but I did not say anything. They did not use the veil that matched the cope, and took a veil out of the drawer. It was a nice veil, but how strange when I had brought the veil to match the cope.

Well, we had Benediction, and people sang their hearts out; of course no bells were rung at Benediction! The response got mixed up, as the Bishop did not use the altar card with the responses on them, so that everybody said it together with the Bishop! Well the petition had to be signed again after Mass for the next Mass; it is in the bad area of the city; this one was in the suburbs. Father G said to me after Mass to bring everything for the next Mass; he wanted a Blessed Mother vestment; he liked the cope. I spoke with the Bishop after Mass and said thank you for Benediction, but said "You don't know how much we appreciate it, and Father G is mad." The Bishop said, "I am happy," and winked his eye as if he had shown Father G his authority and had won out, but Father G told me in the Sacristy, "No Benediction next time!"

The collection was not good, as the people held up this time. The Bishop gets the whole thing. Compared with last time it was very disappointing, but the people are fighting back; also, this Mass was at 6:30 P.M. on a Sunday evening.

Letter 2

We had our fourth Old Mass for this year; the pastor came out before Mass and gave us a brief summary of the beautiful church and encouraged us to love the New, but to remember to pray at this Old Mass. Then he went back to the rectory. We did have free roam of the church and could do as we wanted. We had to put everything back when we were through. I brought the Roman Style Blessed Mother vestment that Father G had requested, but he did not wear the alb. It was cut lace, and he did not bring his cassock, so he wore a modern white alb. The Mass went fine, except he read the Gospel only in English and he goofed up at

last blessing, but otherwise it was OK. It was a sung Mass, so we had no prayers after for the conversion of Russia. The rosary was recited before Mass but by someone else, as I was busy in the Sacristy getting everything ready.

We had no bad discussions; Father G wanted some chalice veils from me, so I dropped them off in the chancery office Monday and was able to talk with him for almost an hour! At first he said he thought I was a kook, but now he knows better, and he said stick with him and he will teach me tact and diplomacy. He admitted he did not prefer the Old Mass; he spoke as though he considered himself our personal chaplain. He told me of a Father Z who is studying in Rome and who is the bishop's personal confidant; he is the one who is giving us all the trouble. I asked, "Is it possible to have one more Mass in the coming year?" He said, "The Bishop decides." I asked, "Could I sit in at some of these discussions to present our side of the story?" "No!" He showed me the letter he was sending to the Bishop about the Old Mass we just had. The crowd was small, 150 at the most; our friends from Canada did not come, only one Canadian because they got tired of being yelled at! And don't forget, we still have many restrictions to follow; no advertising, etc. We did not have to fill a petition out after this Mass.

But Father G did put this in his report: somehow, I don't know from where, but a bunch of people from the Bayside movement were at the Mass, and they sort of told him off at the coffee and doughnuts after Mass (I did not stay for that; I was running late), and this is what Father G told me. I told him that we had nothing to do with Bayside, and we did not invite those people. It looked bad for us because of them.

So I was glad he understood we had nothing to do with them, and it was just by accident that they came.

Also, another pastor asked to have the Old Mass for his parish, but he was told that he could not offer the Mass and that Father G would say the Mass. This pastor was an older priest who said, "If I can't say the Mass in my own church, nobody else will!" So the result is that the poor parish is deprived of it.

Essay Of The Chairman

(Continued From Last Issue)

As signs of Pope Paul's hesitation utterly to abolish the old rite, Capponi cites the English Indult and the permission for old priests to use the traditional rite in private Masses. It is also strange to note that Msgr. De Castro Mayer, Bishop of Campos, Brazil, was allowed to maintain the old rite in his diocese without being removed (for he deprecated the new

missal), and in the United States, the Bishop of Green Bay, Wisconsin, allowed Fr. Edward Bujarski to use only the old missal when celebrating Mass for a congregation of 300 people over thirteen years.

4. No instruction of a Roman Congregation can of itself abrogate or obrogate customary or canon law, unless the Pope approves the instruction in such a way so as to make it his own act (approval *in forma specifica*); unless it is beyond a doubt that the Pontiff has this in mind, the instruction is assumed to be approved without this intention (i.e., *in forma communi*). Capponi holds that all the instructions on the liturgical reform that have emanated from the Congregation of Divine Worship (and from its predecessor the Sacred Congregation of Rites) have Papal approval *in forma communi* only.

The views of Neri Capponi may therefore be summarized as follows.

Since, then, the Constitution *Missale Romanum* perhaps obrogates *Quo Primum* but certainly does not abrogate the millenary and particular customary law that regulated the Mass of the Roman and Latin Church prior to the Pian Bull, the rite remains in force (for this, if for no other reason) alongside the new one regulated by the Pauline Constitution. (Capponi, *Some Juridical Considerations on the Reform of the Liturgy*, p. 22.)

The Congregation for Divine Worship is in error when it persists in regarding the survival of the ancient Roman rite as entirely exceptional and in derogation from [i.e. a permitted exception to] the law, . . . when, at least by virtue of established custom, all celebrants should be free to use it and all the faithful to take part in it. (*Op. cit.*, p. 25.)

Capponi's arguments have actually been used in controversy; we cite one example.

My Lord Cardinal, it is the opinion of this Society that the use of the customary Missal cannot be forbidden. The Pope has never rescinded the Bull *Quo Primum*, nor the right of immemorial custom, both of which give priests a perpetual right to use, both in public and in private, the Tridentine or Roman Missal. (From a letter of Geoffrey Houghton-Brown, President of the Latin Mass Society of England and Wales, to John, Cardinal Heenan, November 28, 1971.)

Some have gone beyond the arguments presented thusfar and actually hold that Pius V had the power to bind his successors never to change or revoke his bull, that his inflated language means what it says. Others, like

Hugh Ross Williamson, the English convert, believed that the new canons promulgated by Pope Paul were invalid, and that no priest, however sound his theology and however passionate his devotion, could say a valid Mass if he used them.

So stark and appalling a conclusion has presented the great body of the faithful with an almost intolerable strain. It has even led some to the conclusion that an invalid Mass is valid if only it is said in Latin. They have formed an Association for Latin Liturgy, against which the faithful should be warned, not because it has any standing, but because the Hierarchy, to the further confusion of the people, might seem to patronize it by appearing to grant a Latin Mass. (Hugh Ross Williamson, *The Great Betrayal*, p. 27.)

In France, the Abbe Ducaud-Bourget attacked the new order of Mass in Latin.

You generously grant our faithful masses that they do not want. It is true that these will be encrusted with Latin and Gregorian Chant so that someone might be deceived by the label on the merchandise. A trick. A strange form of honesty, it appears. Do you think our faithful go to mass as to a concert? (*Face a Face: Mgr. Ducaud-Bourget - Cardinal Martyr 1968-1977*, Editions Chire, Chire-en-Montreuil, 86190 Vouille, 1977, p. 93.)

The Abbe's congregation went on to occupy the Parisian church of St. Nicholas du Chardonnet, where they have remained since February 27, 1977. It is thus wrong to think that if the 1970 Order of Mass were more frequently celebrated in Latin, all agitation for the old rite would cease.

We may conclude this section with the following arguments against the thesis of Count Neri Capponi.

If somebody observes the law, it is not *consuetudo*, but the observance of the law. The *consuetudo* can be *praeter legem*, i.e., some obligation is introduced by force of observing it, even if a specific law does not exist. *Consuetudo contra legem* means that a law for a long time is not observed, and after a certain period of time the law loses its force of obligation, and the *consuetudo* receives the force of the law. The fact that the priests celebrated the Mass for four hundred years does not constitute a *consuetudo*, it was simply the observance of the existing law. In consequence, if there is a new law, it has to be observed, as the old law had to be observed. No argument *ex consue*

tudine is possible. (Fr. Blaise Fuez, O. Cist., Prior of Our Lady of Spring Bank, Sparta, MN, in a letter to the author, 1985.)

About the Bull *Quo Primum Tempore*, Fr. Fuez wrote:

The expressions which we find in the Bull are legal formulas which we find in all Bulls, or in most of them, which promulgate a law. All these expressions served one purpose: to show that nobody can change the given law, only the Pope. As no parliament can prevent a later one from changing a law which they had made, so a Pope can prevent anyone **except his successor** from changing the law he makes. If Pius V had the right to make the law about the "Tridentine Mass", Paul VI had the right to make a new law. If the law of Paul VI is not valid, then the law of Pius V is not valid either. (*Ibid.*)

From the first of these two passages, one may conclude that the celebration of Mass solely in the vernacular languages is fast becoming a *Consuetudo praeter legem*. Support for the stand taken by Prior Fuez may be found in the book *The Mass from St. Pius V to Paul VI* by Dom Guy Oury (Solesmes, 1975, ISBN 2-85274-013-3, French), who rejects the thesis that the old Mass may still be celebrated because of tradition. Dom Guy says that the Bull of St. Pius is obrogated by Pope Paul's Constitution by virtue of Canons 22 and 23 (old code), and that the reason Pope Paul did not proscribe the old Missal *expressis verbis* in his Constitution was that he intended exceptions to be made in very rare circumstances (e.g., old priests celebrating *sine populo*, the English Indult) with the approval of the Ordinary and the Congregation of Rites. As for the claim that one may now resort to the old Missal by virtue of immemorial custom, Dom Guy rejects it outright with the following observations: 1) The maintenance of a custom contrary to the Code does not depend solely on those who want to observe it, but on the expressed or tacit approval of the competent authority, who has decided that its suppression would cause more of a problem than its toleration. 2) The promulgation of a new law does not transform the old into a custom, otherwise the legislator would legislate in vain. He does not consider Capponi's argument that the Bull of Pope Pius merely added the force of positive law to the previously existing customary law. (See page 16 of the last newsletter).

VI

There are those who, without denying the legitimacy of the revised Missal and not all necessarily preferring the old rites, have complained about certain supposed deficiencies in

the new liturgical books. Before mentioning some of their chief complaints, I bring to the attention of the reader the intimate connection between liturgy and doctrine that is best illustrated by the following episode from the life of Henry Hart Milman, Dean of St. Paul's, as reported by his son Arthur.

Early in 1864, a Royal Commission was appointed to consider the forms of subscription and declaration of assent required from the clergy of the United Church of England and Ireland, and how they might admit of alteration, and upon this "Clerical Subscription" Commission, as it was shortly entitled, my father accepted a seat. The Commissioners held many meetings, and at one of their later ones my father proposed that the only subscription to be required should be subscription to the Liturgy, to the Book of Common Prayer, on the ground that the doctrines of our Church are more simply, fully, and more winningly taught in the Liturgy than in the Articles. (Arthur Milman, *Henry Hart Milman, D.D., Dean of St. Paul's, A Biographical Sketch*, New York, E. P. Dutton & Co., London, John Murray, Albemarle Street, 1900, p. 244).

We see here at work the principle that the *lex supplicandi* must be the *les credendi*. If, for example, as Dean Stanley pointed out,

the only sacrifices acknowledged in the English Prayer Book are those of praise and thanksgiving, and still more emphatically of human hearts and lives (A.P. Stanley, *Historical Memorials of Westminster Abbey*, 4th edition, London, John Murray, 1876, p. 529, note 1),

then one may conclude that the "Holy Sacrifice of the Mass" is not a doctrine of the Church of England.

We now proceed to note that the extensive changes made in going from the old Roman Missal to the new appear to some who are competent to hold an opinion to have produced texts which do not embody as they ought the dogmas of the *lex credendi*. Three serious objections are:

1) **There is a "neo-Pelagianism diffused throughout the prayers of the new missal.** Except for the brief period of Lent, there is never a question of sin and its consequences: the weakness of human nature, the passions and temptations. The texts of the old Roman Missal, however, conforming to the whole mystical life of the saints, always asked God for protection against these dangers and begged

pardon for failings. The Popes constantly repeat that the "greatest sin of the modern world is its having lost the sense of sin", but they do not seem to observe that the new missal is a powerful agent of this chloroforming of consciences. Without doubt one asks for God's grace, but for all practical purposes the spiritual life is conceived to be entirely dependent on the energy and generosity of man. (Letter of a Benedictine monk to the author, August 20, 1983).

The most learned exposition of this charge of "neo-Pelagianism" is found in the Fall 1977 article of Professor Toporoski of Toronto in the *International Catholic Review Communio*.

2) **There is a near suppression, for all practical purposes, of the cult of the saints** by a) the quashing of the appropriate readings in a majority of cases, and b) the omission in the prayers of any mention of recourse to their intercession. Almost all the prayers fall into the following pattern: "God, who rose up the great Saint N., make us burn with love like him . . . in the service of our brothers and sisters". (*Ibid.*)

3) **There is a denial, for all practical purposes, of the beatific vision for the souls of the dead.** It is now only a matter of "hope of the resurrection", "waiting for the resurrection", "desire for the resurrection". But the resurrection is certain for all (*John V 29, I Corinthians XV 51*). Whether to life or to condemnation is determined at the particular judgment at the moment of death, and the prayers of the faithful and of the Church are unable to make any change in this respect. The liturgy of November 2 is characteristic of this point of view; it has become a votive feast of faith in the resurrection. One can scarcely find in one or another *oremus* a trace of the possibility that the souls of the dead may be enjoying the beatific vision. (*Ibid.*)

The most authoritative complaint came from Alfredo Cardinal Ottaviani and Antonio Cardinal Bacci in their letter to Pope Paul VI of September 25, 1969.

If we consider the new elements implied or taken for granted, which, of course, may be evaluated in different ways, the new order of Mass represents, both as a whole and in its details, a striking deviation from the Catholic theology of the Holy Mass as formulated at the Council of Trent during the twenty-second session. (*Et Pulsanti Aperietur, Una Voce*, CH-1815 Clarens, Switzerland, 1980, p. 15).

According to Dom Oury (p. 45), Cardinal Ottaviani was displeased by the unauthorized publication of his letter and was indeed satisfied by the assurances Pope Paul gave in response to his initiative:

I am sorry that people have made use of my name in a way that I did not want by publishing a letter that I had addressed to the Holy Father without authorizing its publication. I greatly rejoiced when I read the allocution of the Holy Father on the questions raised about the new order of Mass and in particular the doctrinal explanations made in his addresses at the public audiences on November 19 and 26; after these, I suppose, no one can truly be shocked. It remains to put out a prudent and intelligent explanation to remove certain legitimate worries that the text [of the Missal and its Introduction] arouses.

In reply, the Holy See later explained certain passages in the *Institutio Generalis Missalis Romani* which had caused disquiet. Later, the authenticity of Cardinal Ottaviani's expression of satisfaction was contested by M. Jean Madiran (Itinéraires, supplement to issue 142, April, 1970). Dom Oury defends in great length the thesis that the new Missal teaches the unadulterated Catholic faith.

I decline to enter further into this great controversy, and leave it to the individual competent reader to determine the weight of the cardinals' specific objections, which appeared in English translation in the December, 1969 issue of the magazine *Triumph*, pp. 22B-22L. One may conclude by observing that even many who like the changes agree that they are more than just liturgical, and that the opportunity was taken to divest the Church of some of her Mediaeval baggage.

The ecclesiology behind the Tridentine Mass is **not** that of the Church today, but rather that of the late Middle Ages and up to the 19th Century inclusive. (Msgr. E.J. Clark, Rector of the Scranton Diocesan Seminary of St. Pius X, in a 1985 letter to an LLA member.)

VII

The survival of the Latin Liturgy is best promoted by having Masses sung or said entirely in Latin, and not by contriving ceremonies in which Latin and English are mixed. It is the most humble and private opinion of the author that to insert Latin chants into a vernacular celebration, while better than nothing, is merely a make-shift; the morsels thereby intruded have all the appearance of museum pieces and interrupt the unity of the sacred rite. It is doubtful whether the hybrid ceremonies make any sense, and for the same

reason that Dr. Johnson condemned Pope's use of both English and Latin in his epitaph for the monument of James Craggs in Westminster Abbey.

It may be proper here to remark the absurdity of joining, in the same inscription, Latin and English, or verse and prose. If either language be preferable to the other, let that alone be used; for no reason can be given why part of the information should be given in one tongue, and part in another, in a tomb more than in any other place, or any other occasion. . . Such an epitaph resembles the conversation of a foreigner, who tells part of his meaning by words, and conveys part by signs. (A.P. Stanley, *op. cit.*, p. 237.)

Just as Johnson himself wrote all his inscriptions in Latin, refusing "to disgrace the walls of Westminster Abbey with an English inscription" (*ibidem*, p. 298), the survival of the Latin Liturgy is best assured by having the entire Mass sung frequently in that language.

It is particularly beautiful to hear the epistle and gospel sung in Latin. In practice, however, it may be impossible to have this done. Once, for example, when the Chairman was arranging the particulars for a Latin High Mass and had indicated that the readings were to be chanted in Latin, and then repeated afterwards in English before the homily, the liturgist protested with all his authority that this was bad liturgical practice. The Chairman agreed, but what was omitted was the English reading, not the Latin chanting, much to that official's surprise. One must be warned, however, not to arouse the indignation of these diocesan liturgical functionaries, whose authority exceeds that of oecumenical councils and sovereign pontiffs. It is similarly counterproductive to challenge the authority of those bishops who have forbidden the celebration even of the new order of Mass in Latin. In banning Latin outright, these bishops may act beyond their powers (*sed vetuere patres, quod non potuere vetare*, Metamorphoses IV 61), but to engage in public controversy with them is counterproductive; it will accomplish nothing but stir up ill will, and the Holy See, if one appeals to it, will do nothing. However, anyone with sense can see that a new wind blows from Rome, and the local authorities will find it more and more uncomfortable to wage war against Latin in the future.

From The Vice-Chairman

In early November I was, for the first time, a visitor to the Eternal City of Rome. On the Feast of All Saints I attended the Mass celebrated in St. Peter's Basilica by his Holiness, Pope John Paul II. During the

course of this Mass the Holy Father solemnly beatified three persons; two sisters from Germany and a brother from France. Consequently, the Basilica was filled with countless persons from Germany and France, as well as many Americans and Italians and a host of pilgrims from all over the world.

How wonderful it was that the Holy Father was able to address **every** member of that international congregation in words all of them could understand: "*Dominus vobiscum!*". How joyful that all could respond together, "*Et cum spiritu tuo*". The great utility of Latin as a bridge which unites Catholic worshippers of many tongues could not have been better illustrated.

The occasion was certainly a joyous one. It was not until afterwards that the sad reflection came to my mind that the millions of younger Catholics who are growing up in the Latin-less parishes of America and several other nations will some day visit Rome and be totally lost at the papal Mass. "I wonder what he is saying," they will muse. "I wonder what I should say. How I wish I could pray with all these people in unison." But they will have been robbed of their opportunity, since they will never have heard a Latin Mass. The great sign of unity will have been shattered.

If you have the Latin Mass near you, support it faithfully. If you do not, please ask your pastor to start saying it a few times a year, at least. Your local chapter can help you present the case for Latin effectively.

On the Feast of All Souls I was fortunate to attend Mass celebrated at the high altar of the Basilica of St. John Lateran, the official cathedral of the Archdiocese of Rome, celebrated by a member of the Sacred College. Mass was accompanied by a choir from Norfolk, Virginia, who sang the Mass most beautifully in Latin. Again, the congregation was united.

But what a contrast was presented on the following day, when I attended Mass at Assisi, celebrated in the crypt church where St. Francis of Assisi is buried. The principal celebrant was an American pastor—no doubt a good man, one may presume, and one who loves his flock—who made a complete muddle of it.

At St. Francis' tomb the altar is constructed so that Mass **must** be celebrated facing the East, with celebrant facing away from the congregation. Clearly the celebrant was very uneasy with this (even though it represents the actual practice of the early Church, as scholarship has clearly proven); he kept turning around, heavy Missal in hand, and attempting to say as much as he could *versus populum*. From time to time he would interpolate his own thoughts and words into the Mass, as additions to or even substitutions for the correct

text, as if the Mass were his own personal property which he felt free to treat as he saw fit, instead of being the common legacy of all Catholics. Lastly, at the start of the Our Father he commanded the members of the congregation to hold hands during that prayer, which they did, some with ease and others with much embarrassment. What a mistake! In the American culture, only little children or those recently fallen in love hold hands in public. By compelling everyone either to act at variance with cultural norms or else to single themselves out as Grinches by refusing to clutch, he had turned a beautiful opportunity for unity into a painful episode of internal division.

Be assured that I prayed for the Association at the sacred sites in Rome. I remembered many of you by name, and hope that the Lord will bless you for the work that you do and the sacrifices which you make—in money, in prayer, in time—for the advancement of this wonderful cause.

Let me say a word about the second of these in particular: prayer. We must never forget that our apostolate is primarily a spiritual one. We have had limited success these last few years, but much more progress is necessary. Americans have a practical turn of mind, and usually understand all about the need for organization, fund-raising, programs, and so on. Yes, we do need these things. But my opinion is that the main reason our success has been so limited is that very few prayers are being said for the return of Latin worship on a frequent basis. Prayer is primary.

May I ask each of you to make a resolution to say at least one Hail Mary a day for the sake of the Latin Liturgy? Can many or most of you offer up one Rosary a week for this intention? Could some of you offer your participation in the Holy Sacrifice of the Mass on certain days for this intention? Lastly, could some of our priest members say a Mass voluntarily every now and again for the Latin Liturgy Association? You will have done us a great service indeed.

Before closing, let me mention that the chairman has entrusted me with the responsibility for organizing the next national convention of the Association. We received so much positive comment on our first meeting that a second one seems very desirable. We are not yet committed to the concept of an annual convention; biennial may be sufficient for a fairly small organization, as we are. But these meetings are desirable for at least three reasons: first, they do much good for those who can attend; second, they produce an increase in our membership, especially in the local area which hosts the convention; and third, the publicity generated helps to advance our cause in the public eye.

If you are a chapter officer and believe that

your chapter can and should host a national convention of the L.L.A., please contact me at P.O. Box 80426, Baton Rouge, LA 70898. But be warned that the amount of effort involved is considerable—M.J. Moses and the members of the Washington chapter will vouch for that! If you are not chosen for the next convention, the experience of organizing a “bid” will help you to become the host for one at a subsequent date. Your suggestions for the program are also welcome. In particular we are in need of experienced, well qualified speakers who may be willing (depending on the exact date and place of the convention) to give a talk *gratis*, out of love of the cause.

I give my congratulations to my successor as L.L.A. Secretary, Mr. John M. Spangler of Kentucky, and wish him every success in the office. Finally, please remember John and Anthony and me in your prayers through the year ahead. May the light of Our Lord's love shine on you!

Robert J. Edgeworth

Essay **The Impossibility Of Translating Gregorian Chant**

Edward J. Butterworth, Ph.D.
Niagara University

Motivated by the desire to adapt liturgical forms to ‘modern’ society, there have been several proposals (and even a few attempts) to translate Gregorian chant into English. The chant melody is retained, but adapted to the metrical structure of the English-language replacement of the Latin text. The result is predictably worthy of the tower of Babel, and my intention in this article is to show that this problem is not merely due to lack of skill on the part of the translators and arrangers (although this certainly plays a part), but that Gregorian chant is inherently intranslatable. I will examine the nature of Gregorian chant in the context of its place in the liturgy, and show that the attempt to translate it will present aesthetic difficulties. These in turn give rise to theological and liturgical problems, which strike at the very root of Christianity.

I. Nature and Role of Gregorian Chant

It is perhaps best to begin with the place of Gregorian chant in the liturgy, as clarified by the Second Vatican Council: “The Church recognizes Gregorian chant as being specially suited to the Roman liturgy. Therefore, other things being equal, it should be given pride of place in liturgical services.”¹ For reasons that will shortly become evident, later documents clarified that when ‘Gregorian chant’ is referred to, it is assumed to be in Latin.² These two pieces of information must be considered

together. That Gregorian chant is integrally liturgical and that it is in Latin (with the single exception of the *Kyrie*) are both, taken together, of its very nature. This nature bears further examination.

From the above it follows immediately that Gregorian chant is not merely an arbitrary collection of ‘songs’ or pieces of music. In one sense it is identical with the performance of the liturgy itself, when that liturgy is performed in the manner considered most fitting by the Roman Church. Thus it must be understood as an internally unified interpretation of the entire liturgical structure. Alternative interpretations may be permissible, but this is the one which is to be accorded ‘pride of place’. Likewise, Gregorian chant cannot be properly understood as a collection of texts arbitrarily ‘set’ to melodies which are in principle interchangeable. Rather the Gregorian chant, in the unity of text and melody, exists as a response to a unified Source, which here will only be referred to as the Sacred.³ This is obviously not intended as an historical description of the origins of Gregorian chant, but rather is teleological: it describes that end toward which the sacred chant is directed, and which therefore can be said to call it into being.

Hence, in order to discuss Gregorian chant adequately, we must situate it in the context of the chanted liturgy: only there can its aesthetic and theological qualities be properly evaluated. The innermost nature of Gregorian chant, as manifest in Catholic teaching and confirmed by the Second Vatican Council, is thus that of a sacred act, inseparable from the sacred liturgy of which it is the most appropriate manifestation. Such an act is called forth by the Sacred and must return to the Sacred. In this context we turn to the thorny problem of translation.

II. Aesthetics and Theology

The aesthetic difficulties of translating the sacred texts into English (or any other modern language), while retaining the chant melodies, are almost too obvious to mention. The differences in sentence structure, word order, inflection, and syllable length between the two languages are alone sufficient to guarantee the failure of such an effort. Even modern poetry cannot be translated without loss into another modern language, and the need to adapt to a musical setting poses additional difficulties. The vehemence with which secular musicians object to translation is powerful evidence of this. In the case of Gregorian chant, a sacred text is expressing itself through a unique melodic form, which almost seems to grow from the texts themselves, but does so through the nourishing presence of the liturgy. Consequently, Gregorian chant is uniquely beautiful in the very act of being uniquely liturgical. Thus a translation would be no

more than an illegitimate hybrid, incapable of communicating the meaning and beauty of the liturgy.

The theological significance of beauty has been far too often overlooked. While the other Platonic ideals (One, True, Good) have been applied to God unequivocally, that of Beauty has been applied at best tangentially in recent Western thought.⁴ This represents a serious lacuna in Catholic theology, one that has only recently been addressed, for example, by Hans Urs von Balthasar's steps in the direction of a theological aesthetics.⁵ The great writers and mystics of the Middle Ages, however, were not always so deprived; and it is the fruit of their heightened awareness that we experience in the liturgical form of Gregorian chant. The chanted liturgy is beautiful—it needs no further justification. The compromise of this beauty inherent in the attempt to translate the chanted texts thus has serious theological implications.

This follows because the theological implications of the aesthetic elements are founded upon a more primal element: the absolute Beauty of God. The beauty of the liturgy must reflect this. Recent Catholic history, both before and after the Second Vatican Council, has not always honored this principle, to the detriment of spiritual life everywhere. The beauty of Gregorian chant is not a mere titillation of the senses: it is an integral aspect of the sense of the Sacred, and, by implication, of the liturgy itself. The point has been aptly noted by Cardinal Ratzinger:

The Church is to transform, improve, 'humanize' the world—but how can she do that if at the same time she turns her back on beauty, which is so closely allied to love?⁶

It belabors the obvious to reiterate that translating Gregorian chant would compromise its beauty, but it is not always understood that this is also tantamount to compromising its spiritual integrity and its transforming power.

III. The Spirituality of Gregorian Chant

The analysis above indicates that a particular spirituality can be associated with Gregorian chant, one which must be understood as a special form of liturgical spirituality. It follows immediately, as well, that this must be a spirituality of beauty: the liturgy, like the heavens (Psalm 19), must declare the glory of God.

The Church must not settle down with what is merely comfortable and serviceable at the parish level; she must arouse the voice of the cosmos and, by glorifying the Creator, elicit the glory of the cosmos itself, making it also glorious, beautiful, habitable, and beloved.⁷

This spirituality begins at the very point at

which all concern for utility and function is recognized as falling short, where it is immediately evident that usefulness, in the final analysis, comes up devoid of meaning and value. Is there a 'function' or 'use' to God's free act of bringing the cosmos into being? Spirituality does not operate at the level of function. Neither, therefore, can the liturgy (or its preeminent form, the Gregorian chant liturgy) be regarded as serving a function. Instead, it represents the point at which all function passes over into that which cannot be justified by its usefulness, because it requires no justification. This is where transcendence comes under consideration, as is explained in J.M. McDermott's definition of the sacrament:

The sacrament may be defined as the unity in diversity of the finite with the infinite in such a way that in and through a finite form the infinite God makes Himself present to man in a call for the total response of love, and upon man's response is based the eschatological judgment.⁸

The finite form does not merely perform a function: it embodies openness to the infinite. This can only be possible if the finite form has within it the seeds of transcendence, which are found in the transcendental realm of beauty. Hence the sacramental and liturgical spirituality of Gregorian chant is identically a spirituality of beauty.

Gregorian chant thus 'means' much more than the immediate verbal content of the words of its texts. Hence the argument that a translated text 'means' the same as the original has its feet pulled out from under it. Even assuming a technically accurate translation (which is a big assumption when one considers the current English translation of the liturgy!), the undisputed fact that the aesthetic qualities cannot be translated is alone sufficient to nullify the value of such a project. The significance of liturgical spirituality surpasses the formal content of the words employed to frame it, and forces us into the realm of beauty. This realm is inaccessible to the contrived ugliness of a translated chant.

We have arrived here at a *nexus mysteriorum*, a confluence of the elements that make us aware of the presence of the Sacred. It is characteristic of our sense of the Sacred that it entwines these elements: they cannot be arbitrarily separated. If one facet of a diamond is dirtied, the whole diamond will shine with greatly diminished brilliance. The Latin language is an irreducible element of the Gregorian chant liturgy. The structure of the Latin texts, in conjunction with the place in which they stand in relation to the liturgy, actually **forms** the melodic line, emanates it forth in a context of sanctity. Its beauty stems from this confluence. The arbitrary insertion of the different set of sounds, metrical values,

and sentence structures implicit in the use of a different language, destroys this confluence, and along with this destroys its power to communicate the sense of the Sacred. Lacking this, the liturgy's power to communicate externally the awareness of the divine grace being communicated internally is compromised.⁹ One notes with interest that the scholar who perhaps understood the English language better than nearly anyone else this century, J. R. R. Tolkien, was in implacable opponent of the English liturgy. Gregorian chant, as a liturgical form, is a seamless garment, of which the Latin language is an intrinsic dimension. The removal of one dimension destroys the whole. Hence, the task before us is not to attempt to translate the Latin chant, but rather to awaken ourselves to the spirituality implied in the aesthetic value of the chant. This spirituality is desperately needed in our present situation. The closing words can only be left to Jacques Maritain: "There is finally a sacred magic . . . which has its source in the unutterable desires of the Holy Ghost; it is the magic of Gregorian melody. But it belongs to another universe."¹⁰

Notes

1. *Sacrosanctum Concilium* (1963), 116.
2. See the following documents: "Voluntati obsequens", *Notitiae* 10 (1974); *Ordo cantus Missae* (1974); "Thesaurum cantus Gregoriani", *Acta Apostolicae Sedis* 65 (1973); Letter of Cardinal Villot, *Notitiae* 9 (1973); Paul IV, "Address to *Consociatio Internationalis Musicae Sacrae*", *Notitiae* 9 (1973); *Musicam Sacram* (1967), 47, 50, 52.
3. The authoritative source on this idea is Rudolph Otto, *The Idea of the Holy* (New York: Oxford, 1958). This is masterfully applied to the artistic sphere by John W. Dixon, "The Christology of Michaelangelo: The Sistine Chapel", *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 55, 3 (1987).
4. An example of this can be seen in Ludwig Ott, *Fundamentals of Catholic Dogma* (Cork: Mercier, 1955), pp. 32-35.
5. Balthasar, Hans Urs von. *The Glory of the Lord: A Theological Aesthetics* (San Francisco: Ignatius, 1982).
6. Joseph Ratzinger, *Feast of Faith* (San Francisco: Ignatius, 1986), p. 124.
7. *Ibid.*
8. J.M. McDermott, "A New Approach to God's Existence" *The Thomist* 44 (1980), pp. 219-250.
9. Even the enemies of Gregorian chant recognize this. A good example is Lucien Deiss' *Spirit and Song of the New Liturgy*, which can best be described as a diatribe against Gregorian chant. Its argument is based largely on the intranslatability of Gregorian chant.
10. Jacques Maritain, *Art and Poetry*, tr. E. de P. Matthews (London: Editions Poetry, 1945), p. 73.

Letters To The Chairman

The first letter published below, from the Hon. Secretary of the Latin Mass Society of England and Wales, Mrs. Sue Coote, concerns the Latin Mass Video which the Chairman commented upon earlier in this newsletter.

The second letter, from Mr. William W. Bell of Australia, concerns the recent convention of the *Una Voce* Confederation in Rome which Mr. Bell, a member of our Association, attended in his private capacity.

THE LATIN MASS SOCIETY
For The Preservation Of
The Tridentine Rite

14th December 1987

Dear Professor Lo Bello

I would be grateful if you would mention the Latin Mass Society as the organisers of the ceremonies. We get very little credit and, in fact, were responsible for putting the thing together. My son Jonathan was the thurifer and served the Low Mass and all those present on the Sanctuary plus most of the choir were members of the Latin Mass Society. You will see all my family there, my two little granddaughters and my grandsons together with my daughters and sons, and one son-in-law. It was the Mass previously arranged for our Ruby Wedding Anniversary. We were married in that Church at the same time on the same date. It was a very special day for us.

With every good wish for a Happy Christmas and a Blessed New Year,

Yours very sincerely
Hon. Secretary
Mrs. S. Coote
78 Hurst Lane
East Molesey
Surrey KT8 9DY

18th December, 1987

Dear Professor Lo Bello,

There had been recent negotiations between the Vatican and Archbishop Lefebvre, followed by the appointment, about the time of our Assembly, of Cardinal Gagnon to visit the Archbishop at the Seminary of the Confraternity of St. Pius X in Ecône, Switzerland.

Details of the possible situations which could exist after a decision had been made about Archbishop Lefebvre were discussed at the Assembly by each delegate.

The discussions revealed a clear unanimity of the delegates that *Una Voce* must continue with its work as an independent lay body as it had done for about the past twenty years.

On the second day, members of the Assembly were privileged by a visit, which lasted about two hours, by Augustin Cardinal Mayer, O.S.B.,

Prefect of the Congregation for Divine Worship. Towards the end of the visit, all present were introduced to the Cardinal individually. We were very impressed by His Eminence's spirituality and friendliness.

Every delegate agreed that, despite the unexpected circumstances regarding Archbishop Lefebvre, the Assembly was very successful.

Yours sincerely,
William W. Bell
East Ivanhoe,
Victoria, Australia

1390 Market St. (1727)
San Francisco, CA 94102

Dec. 21, 1987

Dear Dr. Lo Bello,

Allow me to add a few remarks on the *Liber Hymnarius*. I had anticipated that the new hymnal would be a critical edition, with updated scholarship. Instead, it kept surprising me with capricious textual revisions, apparently made with "pastoral" intent: an attempt to make the texts relevant to a modern age.

The only specific case I can cite at the moment is *Audi benigne Conditor*, which has alterations in stanzas 1, 3, and 5. The motive I see here is that Lent no longer involves "jejunium" (though actually not that much "abstinentia" either).

In any case, I'm driven back to the *Antiphonale Monasticum*.

Probably you are acquainted with a book from an earlier era by Dom Olivier Rousseau, *The Progress of the Liturgy*. He traces a long history of liturgical revision, to illustrate his thesis that, despite good intentions, these efforts have always stood for some attempt to alter orthodoxy. Hence the wisdom, in retrospect, of Rome's stubborn resistance to these movements.

Clarence Zaar

Excerpt From The Autobiography Of Watergate Personality G. Gordon Liddy

As tormenting and crippling as had been my fear of God, the rituals of the Catholic Church had conveyed a sense of invulnerability by being in the "state of grace", and the comforting, timeless universality of the Latin Mass

provided a crutch upon which I had leaned in formative years. Could I have climbed that tree to challenge the lightning years ago without the belief in the invulnerability of my soul provided by my "state of grace"? I'll never know. My agnosticism is a poor substitute for the faith I no longer have to give my children. It's sad to realize that those rituals no longer exist to be passed on; like the scent of burning leaves in autumn, they too have been banned and are gone with the wind. (*Will*, autobiography of G. Gordon Liddy, Dell/St. Martin's Press, paperback, page 139. This item was noticed and brought to the Chairman's attention by our member Carl Moore.)

Concerts In Churches

The Congregation for Divine Worship has issued a decree prohibiting the performance of secular music in concerts held in Catholic Churches. Churches can only host concerts of sacred music ("music that was composed for the liturgy"), and these concerts must be free to all. It could be that the Congregation has given up all interest in maintaining Latin in the liturgy, and instead hopes to relegate Latin to "sacred music concerts" in churches; such concerts, it says, are a way to "keep alive the treasures of church music" that are no longer used because they "cannot in any way be conveniently incorporated into liturgical celebrations in modern times". Fr. John A. Gurrieri, executive director of the Bishops' Secretariat for Liturgy, said that one of the positive things about the document was the "insistence that liturgical music of the past that does not suit the reformed liturgy should not be used liturgically". The document notes that the increasing use of churches for concerts of sacred music is to a great extent due to the fact that liturgical reforms designed to promote "an end of greater importance, namely the active participation of the faithful", have made a large body of sacred music from earlier periods "no longer . . . suitable for inclusions within liturgical celebrations".

The Chairman has not yet received the issue of *Notitiae* with the complete text of this decree, and he relies above on the newspaper report that appeared on page 2 of the December 18, 1987 issue of *The Dialog* (Wilmington, Delaware). Although the directive may have been intended primarily to put an end to an unseemly commercialization of churches, it will provide ammunition to enemies of Latin Liturgy who will argue that all Latin Church music now belongs in concerts, not in the liturgy. Today's Catholics are not worthy of the beautiful treasure they have inherited, which they blamefully neglect. The liturgical reform may be compared to the reform of Lisbon made by the earthquake of 1755.

January 2, 1988

Dear Prof. Lo Bello:

On December 5, 1987, the Southern Illinois University Chorale sang at the Tridentine Mass at St. Agatha. The director expressed great interest in our organization and in singing at a Novus Ordo Mass some time in 1988. Locally it appears that LLA is gaining in recognition in the academic community.

Yours sincerely,
Theodore L. Cover
LLA-St. Louis Chapter
6161 Clovergreen Place
St. Louis, MO 63129-2175

Essay By
James B. Hodgson
Treasurer, Washington, D.C.
LLA Chapter

Latin Language Patterning The Concept

For the last two decades, at least, there has been a resurgence of interest in Latin in schools. In many schools there are not adequate teachers available. There is some interest among parents (many of a Latinity so modest that they would not consider tutoring their own children), in having materials and techniques available for this kind of educational enrichment.

There is a perception among many (not without some supporting data) that Latin builds I.Q. The experience of the Philadelphia school system with elementary school Latin seems to point that way. The Washington, D.C. program did not have lasting results, probably because it was being employed not to teach Latin, but to teach "standard" English to children brought up in black families in the "ghetto". This was probably a good idea, but it was not very successful.

It is incontrovertible that Latin has an elitist image. This is probably the reason for its lack of support among the Roman Catholic clergy of the United States. Walter Ong, S.J., of St. Louis University, has highlighted the function of Latin as a rite of passage for young men in the Renaissance. It was, for younger sons of the gentry, the route to influence. We have traditionally taught Latin in a severely disciplinary atmosphere and with a dollop of intellectual snobbery. If the child did not do well, it has been taken as evidence of a lack of intellectual capacity on the part of the child, not of any deficiency on the part of the teaching method or the poor expectations projected toward the less gifted by the teacher, the more gifted classmates, and the parents or guardians.

There are many ways to teach Latin, implementing many traditional and more "progressive" methods. All share a classroom characteristic: the emphasis on learning the

rules and applying them, and of translating to and from the pupil's mother tongue. Many Americans share the opinion that they did not understand English grammar until they had learned Latin. This opinion does not prevail among the younger cohorts whose language instruction followed more contemporary and permissive theories of grammar.

Goals

The acquisition of a naturally fluent command of the language by repetition of carefully structured texts represents a patterning of the brain, and can be done at any age where reading readiness is suspected, but should not be postponed any more than absolutely necessary. The pupil who brings from home, Kindergarten, summer camp, or other source, an ability to understand and speak even simple Latin will then not be overawed when the formal study of Latin in a classroom environment begins.

For Roman Catholics, in view of modern communications media, particularly television, this is or should be a concern. The awkwardness of celebrating the Mass in multiple languages is obvious. The objective stated in the Vatican II *Constitution on the Liturgy* was to make the Mass more understandable. Any serious attempt to achieve this is lost during Masses attended by more than one linguistic nation, and the confusion in reciting the responses does nothing toward exhibiting the catholicity of the occasion.
Continued Next Issue